

CARSON CITY BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Minutes of the February 28, 2012 Meeting

Page 1

A regular meeting of the Carson City Board of Equalization was scheduled for 10:00 a.m. on Tuesday, February 28, 2012, in the Community Center Sierra Room, 851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Heidi McFadden
Vice Chairperson Jed Block
Member Ron Allen
Member Jill Rasner
Member Gary Schulz

STAFF: Dave Dawley, Assessor
Moreen Scully, Senior Deputy District Attorney
Steve Walker, Chief Property Appraiser
Kimberly Adams, Senior Property Appraiser
Tim Clark, Property Appraiser
Don Coon, Property Appraiser
Tamar Warren, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the board's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record. These materials are on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office, and available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (10:01:25) –Chairperson McFadden called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. Roll was called and a quorum was present.

B. PUBLIC COMMENTS (10:01:48) – Chairperson McFadden entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming.

C. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: APPROVAL OF MINUTES – February 14, 2012. (10:02:22) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. **Vice Chairperson Block moved to accept the minutes of the February 14, 2012 meeting as presented. The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Motion carried 5-0.**

D. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA. (10:03:16) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Dawley noted that there were no modifications to the agenda.

E. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF NORTH CARSON CROSSING, LLC, 3185 MARKET STREET; APN 002-755-18. (10:03:25) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Coon presented background information and the Assessor's Evidence, both incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant's Evidence. He also noted that the appellant, Home Depot, had submitted evidence of properties of similar construction at a lower taxable value. After reviewing these properties, the Assessor's Office recommended to reduce the 2012-2013 full taxable value to \$7,910,619. Mr. Dawley, responded to Chairperson McFadden's question by stating that he had been communicating with the Appellant's agent, who was aware of the reduction, and was in agreement to lower the value and correct the occupancy code. **Member Rasner moved to agree with the Carson City Assessor to reclassify the building use and class, for the property located at 3185 Market Street; APN 002-755-18, changing the full taxable value to \$7,910,619. The motion was seconded by Member Schulz. Motion carried 5-0.**

F. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF KENNETH AND REBECCA WALSH, 849 KENNEDY DRIVE; APN 002-731-20. (10:06:29) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Coon presented the Assessor's Evidence, incorporated into the record along with the Appellant's Evidence, and noted that they had derived their valuations based on sales prior to their cutoff date of June 30, 2011. However after receiving additional documentation from the appellant, also incorporated into the record, which extended the valuation period to January 1, 2012, the Assessor's Office had noticed a trend of lowered values in the latter period, from \$102 to \$89 per square foot. Therefore, Mr. Coon recommended an additional five percent economic obsolescence, requesting the property's taxable value to be lowered to \$143,761. Mr. Dawley noted that the new property value was \$98 per square foot and not \$89, as previously stated by Mr. Coon. He also explained that he had been corresponding with the appellant who was pleased with the taxable value. **Member Schulz moved to accept the recommendation of**

CARSON CITY BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Minutes of the February 28, 2012 Meeting

Page 2

the Assessor's office for an additional five percent, for a total of 35 percent, economic obsolescence be applied to Northridge Subdivision (APN Book 2 pages 60, 62, 63, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, and 74), and lower the taxable value to \$143,761, regarding the property on 849 Kennedy Drive; APN 002-731-20. The motion was seconded by Vice Chairperson Block. Motion Carried 5-0.

G. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF SUNRISE, LLC, 2310 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-052-20. (10:12:04) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Walker gave background on the property and presented the Assessor's Evidence, which is incorporated into the record along with the Appellant's Evidence. He also submitted to the record a packet from the appellant, noting that the appellant had submitted identical addenda for subsequent agenda items H, I, J, K, and L. Mr. Walker reviewed the new comparables provided by the appellant and noted that they were not applicable comparisons to the subject property. Mr. Walker stated that due to the long-standing vacancy rate of this parcel and today's economic conditions, an economic obsolescence of 30 percent was applied to the building on the parcel, with an additional 10 percent blanket obsolescence on all commercial properties with commercial improvements; therefore, the property was currently receiving an overall 36.8 percent economic obsolescence, and recommended that the taxable value remain as is. Mr. Walker also clarified that the comparables used by the appellant, although not appropriate for this property, were valued at \$80 per square foot, higher than the \$70 value by the Assessor's Office. **Vice Chairperson Block moved to accept the Assessor's recommendation that the taxable value remain as is for the property located at 2310 South Carson Street, APN 009-052-20. The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Motion carried 5-0.**

H. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF TAMLIN INVESTMENTS, LLC, 2310 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-052-22. (10:20:15) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Walker distributed additional documentation, and noted that several notifications via phone, e-mail, and certified letter, which is incorporated into the record along with the Assessor's Evidence and the Appellant's Evidence, had been sent to the appellant requesting an agent authorization, but had not received a response. Therefore, Mr. Walker recommended the dismissal of this appeal. Member Schulz received confirmation from Ms. Scully that a dismissal was an appropriate action, since the appellants had not conformed to the requirements of the appeal. **Vice Chairperson Block moved to approve the Assessor's recommendation to disallow this appeal, because of the incomplete application. The motion was seconded by Member Allen. Motion carried 5-0.**

I. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF 2340 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-052-23. (10:22:17) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Walker distributed the additional information provided by the appellant, noting that the comparisons were identical to the previous ones, in items G and H. He also gave background on the property and presented the Assessor's Evidence, both of which are incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant's evidence. Additionally, he noted that the lease rates for the property were lowered, bringing the property "in range with the market conditions". Mr. Walker recommended that the property receive a 36 percent overall economic obsolescence. **Member Rasner moved to agree with the recommendation of the Assessor's Office, regarding the subject property located on 2340 South Carson Street, APN 009-052-23. The motion was seconded by Member Allen. Motion carried 5-0.**

J. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF SOUTH CARSON, LLC, 4530 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-266-05. (10:26:16) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Clark gave background information and presented the Assessor's Evidence, both incorporated into the record along with the Appellant's Evidence. He also explained that the taxable value of \$1,440,780 was below the market value of \$2,609,332, based on comparable marked sales data, and the market value of \$1,671,062, based on listings data incorporated into the record, recommending that that the taxable value remain as is. Mr. Clark noted that the information distributed to the Board was identical to the information received for the previous three agenda items. **Vice Chairperson Block moved to approve the Assessor's recommendation of keeping the taxable value as is for property 4530 South Carson Street APN 009-266-05. The motion was seconded by Member Schulz. Motion carried 5-0.**

K. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF SOUTH

CARSON CITY BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Minutes of the February 28, 2012 Meeting

Page 3

CARSON, LLC, 4560 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-266-07. (10:30:58) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Clark presented background information and the Assessor’s Evidence, both incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant’s Evidence. He also explained that the taxable value of \$337,506 was below the market value of \$703,452, based on comparable marked sales data, and the market value of \$754,509, based on the listings data incorporated into the record, recommending that that the taxable value remain as is. **Member Allen moved that the appeal for South Carson, LLC, 4560 South Carson Street; APN 009-266-07, remain the same at the value of \$337,506.** The motion was seconded by Member Schulz. Motion carried 5-0.

L. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF SOUTH CARSON, LLC, 4620 SOUTH CARSON STREET; APN 009-266-09. (10:35:21) Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Clark presented background information and the Assessor’s Evidence, both incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant’s Evidence. He also explained that the taxable value of \$437,731 was below the market value of \$821,500, based on comparable marked sales data, and the taxable value of \$337,506 was below the market value of \$881,125, based on the listings data incorporated into the record. Mr. Clark also noted that the building was completely vacant, and based on that, he recommended that the improved portion of the building receive an additional economic obsolescence of 30 percent, for an overall taxable value of \$416,100. **Member Schulz moved to accept the recommendation of the Assessor’s Office, that the value of the improved portion of the South Carson, LLC building located on 4620 South Carson Street, APN 009-266-09 receive an additional economic obsolescence of 30 percent, reducing the overall taxable value to \$416,100.** The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Motion carried 5-0.

M. FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ASSESSED VALUATION OF SOUTH CARSON, LLC, 211 WEST APPION WAY; APN 009-268-02. (10:40:15) – Chairperson McFadden introduced the item. Mr. Walker presented background information and the Assessor’s Evidence, both incorporated into the record, along with the Appellant’s Evidence. He also distributed the additional information provided by the appellant, noting that the latest comparables provided by the appellant were not relevant as they represented residential properties, while the subject property was a commercial one. Mr. Walker clarified that this property had been appealed to the State Board of Equalization, resulting in a lowered value, citing that the County Board of Equalization had not provided “enough comparable information to hold our value”, and to be certain, he had provided additional historical data this time. Mr. Walker stated that “there had been no sales in this market area under \$11.23 per square foot, much higher than the Assessor’s value of \$8 per square foot”. Therefore, he recommended that the taxable value of \$142,880 remain as is. **Vice Chairperson Block moved to accept the Assessor’s Office recommendation that the value remain as is, for an appeal made by South Carson, LLC, located at 211 West Appion Way, APN 009-268-02.** The motion was seconded by Member Rasner. Motion carried 5-0.

N. PUBLIC COMMENTS (10:46:36) – Vice Chairperson Block entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming.

Mr. Dawley thanked the Board for their time and his staff for a thorough job, providing the necessary documentation required by the State. He also expressed his thanks to Member Allen, who did not plan on returning next year, after serving on this Board for 11 years. Mr. Dawley invited everyone to attend the Board of Supervisors meeting on the following Thursday where Mr. Allen would be presented with a plaque. He also thanked Vice Chairperson Block for resigning from another commission to serve on this Board. Mr. Dawley called this year “very successful”. Member Allen thanked the Assessor’s Office Staff and Mr. Dawley for all their support over the years. Vice Chairperson Block called his service on the Board “eye opening” and referred to the hard work and dedication by the Assessor’s Office to compile the required information.

O. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (10:49:18) – Vice Chairperson Block moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Member Schulz. The meeting was adjourned at 10:50 a.m.

CARSON CITY BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
Minutes of the February 28, 2012 Meeting
Page 4

The Minutes of the February 28, 2012 Carson City Board of Equalization Meeting are respectfully submitted this 28th day of March, 2012.

ALAN GLOVER, Clerk - Recorder

By: _____
Tamar Warren, Deputy Clerk/Recording Secretary