

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 8, 2011 Meeting

Page 1

A meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission (HRC) was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Thursday, September 8, 2011, in the Carson City Community Center, Sierra Room, 851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Vice Chairperson Robert Darney
Commissioner Jed Block
Commissioner Gregory Hayes
Commissioner Mara Jones
Commissioner Donald Smit
Commissioner Lou Ann Speulda

STAFF: Lee Plemel, Planning Director
Jennifer Pruitt, Principal Planner
Moreen Scully, Senior Deputy District Attorney
Tamar Warren, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the Commission's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record, on file in the Clerk's Office. These materials are available for review, in the Clerk's office, during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (5:29:04) – Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present.

B. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (5:29:22) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt requested addressing agenda item F1 after item F7. Chairperson Drews introduced the two new Commission members, Donald Smit, as the building construction representative, and Jed Block, as the resident and property owner representative.

C. DISCLOSURES (5:30:54) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Commissioner Hayes disclosed that he had spoken to his wife, Joan Wright, regarding agenda item F6. Chairperson Drews also disclosed his discussions with Juan Guzman, Carson City Open Space Planner, regarding agenda item F3.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTS (5:31:52) – Chairperson Drews entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming. Ms. Scully clarified that the first Public Comments agenda item was for agenda items, and the second was for non-agenda items. She also informed the Commission that this was one of the changes she would be addressing during agenda item F1.

E. ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES (5:33:01) – Commissioner Hayes moved to approve the minutes of the July 21, 2011 as written by Staff. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Jones. Motion carried 6-0-1, with Commissioner Smit abstaining, as he was not present at the meeting.

F. PUBLIC HEARING MATTERS

F-1 HRC-09-022 DISCUSSION ONLY: A PRESENTATION BY THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE REGARDING THE NEVADA OPEN MEETING LAW AND EX-PARTE COMMUNICATION.

(7:50:10) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Scully outlined the recent changes in the Open Meeting Law, incorporated into the record, and stressed the importance of open communication. She explained the reasons behind the public comments at the beginning and at the end of the agenda, and addressed ex-parte communications.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 8, 2011 Meeting

Page 2

F-2 HRC-11-058 FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: TO APPROVE A REQUEST FROM KURT KRUG OF GREAT BASIN DECK AND SHADE (PROPERTY OWNERS ELKS LODGE) TO BUILD A 12 FEET BY 26 FEET PATIO COVER WITH A SOLID ROOF ATTACHED TO REAR OF EXISTING MAIN STRUCTURE, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO), LOCATED AT 515 NORTH NEVADA STREET, APN 003-222-01. (5:36:14) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt presented a Staff Report, incorporated into the record, giving background and description of the property, in addition to a set of PowerPoint photographs. Ms. Pruitt also informed the Commission that an adjacent property owner had called the Planning Division with “some concerns”, and was encouraged to attend tonight’s meeting to voice those concerns. Ms. Pruitt stated that the applicants were present to address the Commission’s questions regarding the project and the use of materials. She added that the conditions of approval were included in the submitted Staff Report. Kurt Krug, who introduced himself as the owner of Great Basin Deck and Shade, described the patio cover materials he wished to use, to withstand wind and snow. Commissioner Speulda thanked Mr. Krug for the “nicely put together plans” and stated she did not have any issues with the project, as it was being placed in the back of the building. In response to Chairperson Drews’ question, Ms. Pruitt explained that some of the concerns by the objecting neighbor were related to the activities at the Elks Lodge, and stated that they had encouraged the adjacent property owner to relate the objections to the Commission. Chairperson Drews called for public comments, and when none were forthcoming, a motion. **Commissioner Speulda moved to approve HRC-11-058, a request from Kurt Krug, Property owner: Elks Lodge, to construct an attached patio cover on property zoned Residential Office (RO), located at 515 North Nevada Street, subject to the conditions of approval noted by Staff. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hayes. Motion carried 7-0.**

F-3 HRC-11-057 FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: TO APPROVE A REQUEST FROM J.P. COPOULOS (PROPERTY OWNERS CARSON CITY OPEN SPACE) TO DEMO A PORTION OF THE EXISTING RANCH HOUSE COMPLEX, ON PROPERTY ZONED AGRICULTURE (A), LOCATED AT 4900 CARSON RIVER ROAD, APN 010-021-47. (5:44:43) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt presented a Staff Report and supporting documentation, incorporated into the record. She clarified that the subject site was not located in the Historic District, however, a historic determination prepared by Architect J.P. Copoulos and incorporated into the record, recommended that “the house and main buildings had no unique historic architectural elements and do not meet any of the criteria as a Historic Resource”. Therefore, Mr. Copoulos recommended demolition of the structures “to eliminate a hazard and to ensure public safety”. Mr. Copoulos introduced himself and stated that he had been hired by Carson City Open Space to do a historic determination of the Buzzy’s Ranch property. He presented pictures, incorporated into the record, giving background of the property and his recommendation for demolition. He added that a historic analysis was done and the buildings were documented. He also suggested an oral history of the surviving members of the Anderson family. In response to a question, Mr. Copoulos stated that there were no remaining artifacts in the leftover debris. Juan Guzman, Carson City Open Space Manager, explained that the Parks and Recreation Department would like to use portions of the property for interpretive exhibits, for visitors to “have a semblance of what it used to be”. He added that the land would continue to be used for growing pasture for a while, separating it from the exhibits. In response to Commissioner Jones’ question, Mr. Guzman clarified that no federal funds were being used for this project, and that Question 18 funds would be used for the demolition, and Question 1 funds were used to purchase the property. Mr. Copoulos also clarified that several of the structures were not scheduled to be demolished because they were “in decent enough shape”; however documentation was lacking on when they were built. Discussion ensued regarding the documentation of the property history, and whether Certified Local Government (CLG) funds could be used. Commissioner Jones expressed interest in saving some things for interpretation, and understanding the context of the ranch. Vice Chairperson Darney expressed concern over the habitability of the structure, and the hazards associated with it. Chairperson Drews called for public comments, and when none were forthcoming, a motion. **Commissioner Jones moved to approve a request from J.P. Copoulos (property owners Carson City Open Space) to allow the demolition of the existing ranch house, on property zoned Agriculture (A), located at 4900 Carson River Road, APN 010-021-47, which has been determined to be a safety hazard, with the stipulation that the documentation that has been provided be reviewed by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for meeting mitigation standards for demolition. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Speulda. Motion carried 7-0.**

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 8, 2011 Meeting

Page 3

F-4 HRC-11-046 FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: TO APPROVE A REQUEST FROM JOANNE BALLARDINI (PROPERTY OWNERS C & A INVESTMENTS, LLC) TO REPLACE ASBESTOS SHINGLES ON THE SIDING OF THE HOUSE WITH SIMILAR SIDING AND A 4 FOOT WAINSCOTING ON A SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE USED AS AN OFFICE, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO), LOCATED AT 913 NORTH NEVADA STREET, APN 001-187-01. (6:13:24) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt gave background on the property, referring to the Staff Report, incorporated into the record. Ms. Pruitt reminded the Commission that in the previous HRC meeting, the applicant had been requested to remove some of the existing siding on the structure, and presented pictures depicting the removal of the siding on the southern side of the structure. She also stated that the applicant had provided a sample of the proposed replacement siding and a sample of the wainscoting for guidance. Joanne Ballardini introduced herself and Chairperson Drews thanked her for removing the siding, as requested. Commissioner Block explained that he owned two properties that had the same siding as Ms. Ballardini's property and stated that what he had purchased could "replicate the original siding really well". Commissioner Smit confirmed that the wood would hold the paint "pretty well", and that the cedar would protect against insects; however, the composite material would last longer. Commissioner Hayes expressed his preference to the wood, as it "was very close to what was really there", and explained that wainscoting "would change its look". Chairperson Drews and Vice Chairperson Darney agreed that the Commission's preference would be the wood siding without the wainscoting, to "meet our standards", without adding another architectural element to the structure. Commissioner Hayes added that the wood used by Commissioner Block was available at Meek's. Commissioner Smit suggested a location in Mound House that could replicate the existing siding via custom milling. In response to Vice Chairperson Darney's question, Ms. Pruitt confirmed that the project required a building permit. Chairperson Drews called for public comments, and when none were forthcoming, a motion. **Commissioner Jones moved to approve HRC-11-046, a request from Joanne Ballardini to allow the removal and the replacement of existing asbestos siding of the primary office structure on property zoned Residential Office (RO), located at 913 North Nevada Street, APN 001-187-01, subject to the conditions of approval in the staff report and subject to mimicking the original siding as closely as possible with a wood product, and excluding the use of wainscoting for the trim. Additionally, the plans need to be submitted administratively to HRC for approval. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hayes. Motion carried 7-0.**

F-5 HRC-11-060 FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: TO APPROVE A REQUEST FROM PROPERTY OWNERS CARTER AND MARGARET TWEDT TO REPLACE WINDOWS WITH A FRENCH DOOR, ADD A SMALL PORCH AND STEPS WITH RAILING; REPLACE DOUBLE WINDOWS WITH A CASEMENT WINDOW, ON PROPERTY ZONED SINGLE FAMILY (SF6), LOCATED AT 612 WEST TELEGRAPH STREET, APN 003-245-04. (6:32:56) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt referred to the Staff Report, incorporated into the record, and presented background information and photos of the site. Peggy Twedt introduced herself and her husband Carter Twedt, as the owners of the rental property being discussed. She stated that the request for the door, as a replacement for a broken window, had been made by their current tenant. In response to a question by Commissioner Hayes, Mr. Twedt explained that they had selected 48 inch standard double French doors "made to look like they had separate panes", that would be white but "paintable". Ms. Twedt clarified that the narrower door would be sufficient since it would only be used to access the yard. In response to a question by Commissioner Jones, Mr. Twedt stated that the stoop and the railing would be wooden. Ms. Pruitt clarified that the project would require a building permit which would specify the code for the railing. Discussion ensued regarding single versus double-hung, and vinyl versus fiberglass or wood windows. Commissioner Jones cautioned against "heavy" windows. Chairperson Drews called for public comments, and when none were forthcoming, a motion. **Commissioner Block moved to approve HRC-11-060, a request from property owners Carter and Margaret Twedt to replace windows with a French door, add a small porch and steps with railing; replace double windows with a single-hung window with the matching grids out of a material that would be paintable, whether it is fiberglass, aluminum, or wood; and that the railing and the back porch would be made out of a wood material, stipulated with the building code, in the property zoned Single Family (SF6), located at 612 West Telegraph Street, APN 003-245-04. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Speulda. At Commissioner Jones' suggestion, Commissioner Block amended his motion to specify a true divide instead of a window with an internal grid. Commissioner Speulda seconded the amendment. Motion Carried 7-0.**

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 8, 2011 Meeting

Page 4

F-6 HRC-11-045 FOR POSSIBLE ACTION: TO APPROVE A REQUEST FROM PROPERTY OWNERS VIVIAN AND ROBERT SUMMERS TO REPLACE BROKEN, NON-FUNCTIONAL WINDOWS ON A RESIDENTIAL-DUPLEX DWELLING UNITS, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO), LOCATED AT 403 NORTH DIVISION STREET, APN 003-226-04. (6:56:20) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt presented the Staff Report, incorporated into the record. She also presented background information and photos of the property. Ms. Pruitt noted that two letters were included in the late information packet in opposition to this project, and noted that Staff had been in contact with the applicant and had provided her with information regarding exterior alteration requirements by HRC. Vivian Summers, the applicant, stated that the property inspection report had deemed the windows inoperable, and revealed that the title search had indicated the property was “next to the historic district”. She claimed that they were unaware of the HRC requirements, and had replaced the windows at the request of their tenant. Ms. Summers explained that the existing windows could not be opened in case of a fire, and that the trim was rotting. She also stated that they intended to eventually replace all the windows. Ms. Pruitt responded to Chairperson Drews’ question by confirming that a building permit was not required for same opening or size replacements; however, if the new windows were a different size, the applicants required a permit. Commissioner Hayes indicated that the previous owners had added new casement windows without HRC approval. Commissioner Smit explained that the tenants may have not known that they needed to appear before the HRC, if the “trigger that they needed a building permit never happened”. In response to a question by Chairperson Drews, Ms. Summers stated that a total of 24 windows would need replacing, and they had replaced five to date. She explained that they had received a quote for \$36,000 to replace all the windows. Chairperson Drews wished to see a cut-sheet for the windows. Commissioner Speulda suggested moving the newly-installed windows to the back and refurbishing some of the existing windows to be used in the front of the house. Commissioner Smit suggested that Ms. Summers use her contractor as a resource to maintain the integrity of the windows. Chairperson Drews clarified that the current windows did not meet the HRC standards, and suggested reinstalling the existing windows and making them functional, or installing a new window “that mimics that window”. Ms. Pruitt suggested providing the applicant with a timeframe for replacing the windows. She also suggested that the applicant not make any “change-outs” until receiving the Commission’s approval. Discussion ensued regarding the use of the existing windows. Chairperson Drews encouraged Ms. Summers to contact SHPO, and Commissioner Jones mentioned that the windows in question might have salvage value. **Commissioner Smit moved to request owners, Vivian and Robert Summers, to cease to do additional work on the residential-duplex dwelling units, on property zoned Residential Office (RO), located at 403 North Division Street, APN 003-226-04, regarding HRC-11-045, and within a period of four months provide a solution acceptable to HRC for the replacement of the windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Jones. Motion carried 5-0.**

Vice Chairperson Darney left at 7:25 p.m. Commissioner Block left at 7:35 p.m.

F-7 HRC-11-006 DISCUSSION ONLY REGARDING AN UPDATE OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND (HPF) GRANT FOR 2010. (7:46:55) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt noted that the late information packet contained a notification regarding the Board of Museums and History meeting, to take place on September 9, 2011, at the Nevada State Museum, 600 North Carson Street, at 9:30 a.m., to review and nominate the Carson City Historic District’s placement on the National Register of Historic Places. She added that to date, SHPO had received four letters from residents opposing the nomination. Ms. Pruitt also noted that the grant information survey had been presented to SHPO and several corrections were suggested. Commissioner Jones confirmed that individual properties could not request to be excluded from the National Register.

G. STAFF REPORTS

COMMISSIONER REPORTS/COMMENTS. (7:57:25) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Commissioner Hayes suggested meeting monthly, if meeting continue to be long. Chairperson Drews noted that the Commission would take a more active role in the historic preservation efforts of the Open Space acquisitions.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the September 8, 2011 Meeting

Page 5

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT TO THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION. (7:58:56) – Chairperson Drews introduced the item. Ms. Pruitt stated that the next Commission meeting was scheduled for November 10, 2011, however, the Planning Division had not received additional applications yet, but several calls were received from potential applicants. She added that Commissioner Jones would present the Secretary of Interior standards at the next meeting. Commissioner Jones suggested that commissioners contact her or Ms. Pruitt regarding any specific questions regarding the Secretary of Interior Standards.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS (8:01:08) – Chairperson Drews requested updates on the grants.

H. PUBLIC COMMENTS (8:01:55) – Chairperson Drews entertained public comments; however, none were forthcoming.

K. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (8:01:02) – Chairperson Drews entertained a motion for adjournment. **Commissioner Hayes moved to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Smit. The meeting was adjourned at 8:03 p.m.**

The minutes of the September 8, 2011 meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission are approved on this 12th day of January, 2012.

Michael Drews, Chairperson