

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 1, 2006 Meeting

Page 1

A meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Monday, May 1, 2006 in the Community Center Sierra Room, 851 East William Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Rebecca Ossa
Peter Smith
Louann Speulda

STAFF: Walter Sullivan, Planning and Community Development Director
Jennifer Pruitt, Senior Planner
Joe McCarthy, Economic Development / Redevelopment Manager
Michael Suglia, Senior Deputy District Attorney
Kathleen King, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A recording of these proceedings, the commission's agenda materials, and any written comments or documentation provided to the recording secretary during the meeting are public record, on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office. These materials are available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (5:31:35) - Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:31 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo and Commissioners Baker and Darney were absent.

B. ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES (5:31:56) - None.

C. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (5:32:01) - None.

D. DISCLOSURES (5:32:16) - Commissioner Ossa advised of having discussed the project which is the subject of item F-1 with Chairperson Drews and City staff. Chairperson Drews advised of a telephone conference with City staff last Friday to review the agenda materials.

E. PUBLIC COMMENTS (5:32:42) - None.

F. PUBLIC HEARING ACTION ITEMS:

F-1. HRC-05-268 DISCUSSION AND ACTION TO CONSIDER AN APPLICATION FROM FRED DOLVEN (PROPERTY OWNER: PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH), TO ALLOW DEMOLITION OF THE 1947 ADDITION (APPROXIMATELY 1203 SQUARE FEET) TO THE CHURCH, AND ALLOW A NEW, APPROXIMATELY 8483-SQUARE-FOOT CHURCH AND NARTHEX ON THE SOUTHWEST PORTION OF THE SUBJECT PARCELS, ON PROPERTY ZONED RESIDENTIAL OFFICE (RO), LOCATED AT 110 NORTH NEVADA STREET, APNs 003-214-03, -04, AND -05 (5:33:08) - Chairperson Drews introduced this item. Ms. Pruitt thanked the commissioners and the citizens for their attendance. She noted that City staff had met with church representatives and Historic Resources Commissioners since the first submittal of this project in November 2005. A great deal of discussion has taken place, and the church has developed a plan for review and possible approval by the commission. Ms. Pruitt reviewed the staff report, and advised of having received no comment from adjacent property owners, other than the information provided in the agenda materials

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 1, 2006 Meeting

Page 2

which was mainly compiled from previous commission meetings. She noted, for the record, a memo from the Contract Urban Forester regarding the trees on King and Division Streets. She advised that a landscape plan will be required as part of the special use permit, with specificity as to what is to be removed and added to the site.

(5:38:18) First Presbyterian Church Building Committee Chairman Ken Pearson acknowledged having read the staff report, and his agreement with the recommended conditions of approval. (5:38:53) Architect Fred Dolven reviewed the revised plan drawings which were displayed in the meeting room. At Commissioner Smith's request, Mr. Dolven pointed out the 1947 addition on a displayed drawing. He advised of the intent to brace existing walls on the west side of the church. He acknowledged that, other than the west wall, the old church won't be affected. He advised there may be some minor roof protection because of the slopes of the various roof pieces. He acknowledged the existing roof and walls will be left. In response to a further question, he advised the existing walls will be strengthened by virtue of the new walls being adjacent. He further acknowledged that the new construction will tie into the old building.

In response to a further question, Mr. Dolven advised that the rosetta window exists on the west wall of the 1947 addition. It will be removed and installed in the new building. Mr. Dolven responded to additional questions regarding details of the plan. He advised there is no detail, as of yet, as to how the new structure will be tied into the old. In response to a question, Mr. Pearson advised that no determination had yet been made regarding re-use of the construction materials from the 1947 addition. Chairperson Drews suggested utilizing the old brick as part of a fundraising effort. He advised the commission would appreciate any effort to save the old brick, if at all feasible. He offered to facilitate storage of the brick, if necessary.

Chairperson Drews called for public comment and, when none was forthcoming, entertained a motion. Commissioner Speulda noted, for the record, that the 1947 addition is not considered historic. Commissioner Ossa commended the staff report. She noted a typographical error in dates listed in the second line of the Background section of the staff report. **Commissioner Smith moved to approve the application from Fred Dolven, Architect for the First Presbyterian Church, to allow demolition of the 1947 addition of approximately 1203 square feet only of the First Presbyterian Church, and to allow a new church and narthex, of approximately 8483 square feet, on the southwest portion of the subject parcels, on property zoned residential office, located at 110 North Nevada Street, APNs 003-214-03, 04, and 05, subject to the conditions of approval contained in the staff report, with the understanding that any stipulations to the commission by the applicant shall be considered as conditions of approval; demolition of the 1864 and 1896 portions of the church is not approved for the subject application; there are 14 conditions of approval on pages 5 and 6 of the staff report, with the additional finding that the 1947 addition is not a significant historic property. Commissioner Speulda seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.** Chairperson Drews thanked the First Presbyterian Church representatives. He recessed the meeting at 5:51 p.m. and reconvened at 5:54 p.m.

F-2. HRC-06-074 DISCUSSION AND ACTION TO CONSIDER THE 2006 CARSON CITY HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS TO BE AWARDED BY THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IN CELEBRATION OF NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION MONTH, MAY 2006 (5:54:23) - Chairperson Drews introduced this item. Ms. Pruitt provided an overview of the agenda materials, and narrated photographs of the nine nominees. Commissioner Ossa expressed concern over awarding the 408 West Robinson Street property considering the property owner went forward with her project prior to submitting it for review by the commission. She suggested that the entire Albertson's

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 1, 2006 Meeting

Page 3

complex has a railroad theme, and not just the store itself. She commended the work of all involved in the First Presbyterian Church project, but expressed concern over awarding the project prior to its completion. She expressed concern over the 314 West Ann Street and 611 West Robinson Street properties in that they started out as very simple houses and are now “gussied up.” Commissioner Speulda commented that the Resource Concepts building has been continuously maintained for many years without any recognition. She expressed the opinion that the Adele’s Restaurant addition was nicely done, and commended Dr. Gibbons’ office in that it has been maintained in its original condition rather than taken from a simple to an aggrandized version of itself. She expressed a preference for considering the newer projects for awards after they’ve been maintained for a few years. Discussion took place regarding the Bliss Bungalow. Commissioner Smith expressed personal opposition to structures which are “over decorated,” and a preference for those which are simply well maintained. He expressed support for the Resource Concepts building which has been well maintained, well used, and “holds down that corner of town.” He expressed understanding for the concept of the Albertson’s nomination, but didn’t agree it should be awarded. He agreed that awarding the church project this year would be premature. He expressed support for the Adele’s nomination. In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt advised that, in the past, the commission has presented 2-4 awards

Chairperson Drews expressed appreciation for the nominations received from the public this year. He called for public comment; however, none was forthcoming. Discussion took place regarding various categories and the nominees. In response to a question, Chairperson Drews suggested acknowledging the First Presbyterian Church Building Committee, the Economic Development / Redevelopment Manager, and other volunteers. Mr. Sullivan proposed a method by which the commissioners could indicate their preferences. He expressed understanding for the comments provided regarding the First Presbyterian Church, and advised that Ms. Pruitt invested a tremendous amount of time and effort in the project. Commissioner Ossa agreed, and suggested adding Ms. Pruitt as a nominee. She reiterated the opinion that awarding the First Presbyterian Church would be premature. Commissioner Smith noted that the City invested a significant amount of time and funding into the project, and agreed with postponing the nomination. Commissioner Speulda noted that Resource Concepts, Masonic Lodge, Gibbons’ office, and Adele’s Restaurant are all well-maintained, commercial buildings. She commented that the buildings represent the long-term commitment of preservation work, and suggested this as a context for this year’s nominations. Chairperson Drews reiterated the preference for nominating Economic Development / Redevelopment staff, Mr. Wilday, Mr. Ferrari, and Ms. Pruitt. He acknowledged awarding the First Presbyterian Church project may be premature, but commented that “all those players went the distance and really came through.” Commissioner Ossa noted that the listed individuals have been involved with preservation over the course of many years. Chairperson Drews suggested a category for individual awards with a slightly smaller plaque, and the commissioners concurred. Discussion ensued.

At Chairperson Drews’ request, the commissioners listed their preferences. Commissioner Ossa listed Resource Concepts, Albertson’s, Adele’s, the Masonic Lodge, Dr. Gibbons’ office, and the First Presbyterian Church category “as redefined” adding Ms. Pruitt’s name. Commissioner Smith listed Resource Concepts, Adele’s, and Dr. Gibbons’ office. Commissioner Speulda listed Resource Concepts; Adele’s; the Redevelopment staff, First Presbyterian Church Building Committee, and Ms. Pruitt; the Masonic Lodge; and Dr. Gibbons’ office. Chairperson Drews listed Resource Concepts, Adele’s, the First Presbyterian Church, Robin Williamson, Joe McCarthy, Peter Wilday, and Paul Ferrari. Mr. Sullivan reviewed the tally, as follows: Resource Concepts, Adele’s, “the church committee,” the Masonic Lodge, and Dr. Gibbons’ office. In response to a question, Mr. Sullivan noted that the “church committee” would

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the May 1, 2006 Meeting

Page 4

be presented individual awards. Chairperson Drews requested to be able to present the nominations to the Board of Supervisors at their May 18th meeting. He entertained a motion. **Commissioner Smith moved to adopt the tally provided by Mr. Sullivan as the recommendations to the Board of Supervisors for Preservation Awards in celebration of National Historic Preservation Month, HRC-06-074. Commissioner Speulda seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.**

G. FUTURE COMMISSION ITEMS (6:23:28) - Ms. Pruitt acknowledged that discussion of CLG grants would be agendized for the May 11th commission meeting. In response to a question, she advised that the Spears' project would also be agendized for the May 11th meeting.

H. INTERNAL COMMUNICATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

H-1. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM STAFF (6:24:00) - None.

H-2. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS (6:24:14) - Chairperson Drews thanked Ms. Pruitt, Mr. Sullivan, and Planning and Community Development staff for their investment of time and effort in the First Presbyterian Church project.

I. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (6:24:38) - Commissioner Smith moved to adjourn the meeting at 6:24 p.m. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 4-0.

The Minutes of the May 1, 2006 Carson City Historic Resources Commission meeting are so approved this 8th day of June, 2006.

MICHAEL DREWS, Chair