

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 1

A regular meeting of the Carson City Historic Resources Commission was scheduled for 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, October 12, 2004 in the City Hall Capitol Conference Room, 201 North Carson Street, Carson City, Nevada.

PRESENT: Chairperson Michael Drews
Vice Chairperson Mark Lopiccolo
Richard Baker
Robert Darney
Rebecca Ossa
Peter Smith
Louann Speulda

STAFF: Walter Sullivan, Planning and Community Development Director
Jennifer Pruitt, Senior Planner
Heidi Eskew-Herrmann, Planning Technician
Kathleen King, Recording Secretary

NOTE: A tape recording of these proceedings is on file in the Clerk-Recorder's Office and is available for review during regular business hours.

A. CALL TO ORDER AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM (1-0007) - Chairperson Drews called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Roll was called; a quorum was present.

B. ACTION ON APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 14, 2004 (1-0012) - Commissioner Speulda moved to approve the minutes. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo seconded the motion. Motion carried 6-0-1, Commissioner Ossa abstaining.

C. MODIFICATION OF AGENDA (1-0021) - Chairperson Drews advised of a request to modify the agenda to address item F-5 prior to item F-1. (1-0648) Chairperson Drews further modified the agenda to address items F-3 and F-4 prior to item F-2.

D. PUBLIC COMMENTS (1-0030) - Chairperson Drews welcomed Supervisors Williamson and Staub, and thanked them for attending. (1-1989) Supervisor Williamson thanked the Commissioners for their hard work and left the meeting.

E. DISCLOSURES (1-0046) - Commissioner Smith advised of having discussed, with Ms. Harrington, her project following the last meeting.

F. PUBLIC HEARING: ACTION ITEMS

F-1. BAER REPORT, WATERFALL FIRE, TERRY BIRK, NEVADA DIVISION OF FORESTRY (1-0373) - Terry Birk, of the U.S. Forest Service, provided an overview of the Heritage Resources portion of the Waterfall Fire Burned Area Emergency Response Report included in the agenda materials. Commissioner Darney advised of owning property in Kings Canyon located just below the Borda sheep pens, and of a residential foundation on said property which was previously identified as the Quill ranch house. He further advised of a foundation on nearby U.S. Forest Service property which appears to have been a barn. He offered to allow Mr. Birk to photograph the foundation on his property.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 2

Mr. Birk discussed past work done in Kings Canyon and an interest in the toll booth. He advised that a U.S. Forest Service employee has a written history and display of Kings Canyon exhibited at the Great Basin Archaeological Conference in Reno this week. He offered to share the exhibit with the Commission.

In response to a question, Mr. Sullivan advised that the aerial seeding and mulching operations on the burned area are complete. Mechanical seeding is scheduled to be done in the near future. Discussion took place regarding possible funding available for cultural resources surveys, and Mr. Birk offered to coordinate a survey project. Chairperson Drews described the predictive model, recently developed by Gnomon, Inc., for selected portions of the Humboldt-Toiyabe National Forest. He explained that the model focuses on areas with the highest potential for National Register qualification. In response to a question, Mr. Birk advised that most of the burned area was aerial seeded. In response to a further question, he described the cursory survey conducted on Nevada State Park lands and advised that there appeared to be no significant impact. Chairperson Drews discussed the multi-agency aspect to the BAER Report. In response to a question, Mr. Birk advised that the \$12,000 recommended in the BAER Report will most likely be funded by the Natural Resources Conservation Service. Mr. Sullivan advised that he would request Deputy City Engineer John Flansberg to contact Mr. Birk and Chairperson Drews to provide additional information. Chairperson Drews offered to coordinate the Commission's portion of any survey projects. Mr. Birk acknowledged the need to complete assessments before the fall and winter seasons. Chairperson Drews thanked Mr. Birk for his presentation. Ms. Pruitt offered copies of the entire BAER report to the Commissioners.

F-2. DISCUSSION REGARDING PLACEMENT OF ART ON HISTORIC PROPERTIES

(1-1994) - Ms. Pruitt provided background information on this item. She advised that artwork has been placed at the Edwards House, and displayed a photograph of the same. She commented on the quality craftsmanship, and expressed the opinion that the scale and color are appropriate for the site. She requested input from the Commissioners with regard to future requests regarding placement of art on historic properties. Chairperson Drews expressed the opinion that, at a minimum, art work should be required to adhere to the same material standards. Commissioner Ossa noted that the Edwards House artwork is non-permanent. Chairperson Drews suggested integrating a policy with the City's existing signage standards. Commissioner Speulda suggested that artwork should not be attached to, or block the view of, an historic structure. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo suggested considering artwork as part of landscape policies. Discussion took place regarding the Commission's purview over landscape and lighting, and Ms. Pruitt pointed out that this is an ideal time to address the artwork and landscape matters as part of the Historic District Guidelines revisions. Mr. Sullivan suggested reviewing Title 18 and including appropriate language.

F-3. HRC-04-082 ACTION REGARDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR AN APPLICATION FROM JOYCE HARRINGTON REGARDING PORCH AND FAÇADE TREATMENTS, INCLUDING DECKING AND LIFT, ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 408 WEST ROBINSON STREET, APN 003-236-01 (1-0651) - Ms. Pruitt provided background information on this item, and advised of the applicant's interest in receiving direction from the Commissioners with regard to how to proceed with the project. She noted, for the record, City staff's interest in whether the applicant planned to "wrap the brick around the entire building." She advised that staff had documented the brick work done to date and the stairs which are now completed. She further advised that Ms. Harrington has been working with Art Hannafin. She narrated slides of the project and noted, for the record, the quality craftsmanship of the porch.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 3

(1-0728) Joyce Harrington displayed the drawing presented as part of the original application, and noted the brick façade treatment. She acknowledged discussion of the same and the Commission's direction that she submit proposed materials at a future meeting. She advised she had "no intention to go around the system whatsoever, but was really under the gun when all the masonry shops in the entire area of Reno, Sparks, Carson City say, 'We have no more brick and there will be none for three more months,' and now it's wintertime. Carson Masonry had some that someone had reneged on and said, 'Come down with your credit card today.' So I took a leap of faith and I bought that brick and I'm still absolutely enamored with that brick that we've got on there. So that was an executive decision that I made at that point in time and also getting the resources to work on it prior to winter." Ms. Harrington explained that the "reason we began to alter is we found the entire porch was rotten underneath so the whole thing comes up. So at this point in time, a ... 26" elevation from the porch not code, although historic, it was not code. We felt it was unsafe so we started considering raising it up to add some type of baluster treatment that would give us a 36" railing. ... So that was the evolution that came out of the last meeting. There were comments about the balusters and those were, by no means, the final decision on the balusters but this was the proposal for the brick and the second page took an aerial view of that and that identified that they did go out a couple inches and sort of wrapped around the columns. So this was the drawing and then you have the reality of what's occurring out there."

Ms. Harrington reviewed photographs of early 1900s houses which she had researched and which were included in the agenda materials. She advised of photographing brick treatments in the area of Plumas Street and California Avenue in Reno earlier in the day. She referred to comments that the brick piers were "too massive," and advised that Art Hannafin had been providing assistance to develop various conceptual views of the porch. She suggested that reinstalling the columns will begin to balance out the brick treatments. She expressed the opinion that landscape will also begin to diminish the massive appearance.

(1-0808) Art Hannafin advised of having previously served on the Commission, beginning in 1980, and that he lives across the street from the subject project. He further advised that he has recently been involved with the project, over the past week, as a friend of the property owner. He explained the process to develop the three conceptual photographs, which he circulated and described. He discussed his experience as a Commissioner, and expressed the opinion that property owners intentionally or unintentionally moving ahead "to do this kind of thing" has seldom occurred over the past 25 years. He expressed the further opinion that Ms. Harrington was not intentionally "trying to be overt" in moving ahead with the project. "I think that she started off with good intentions in mind and the question before you, based on this kind of presentation, is any part of it or all of it retrievable in your eyes. And that's a difficult question because the quality is there, the intention is sincere. Are there areas that could be modified? Are you subject to modifying some of it or all of it?" Mr. Hannafin expressed appreciation for the difficulty of the situation.

Mr. Hannafin acknowledged that railings will be installed along the steps leading to the porch, although they were not included in the conceptual photographs. In response to a question, Ms. Harrington advised that the same baluster treatment would be installed on the two sets of side steps. She acknowledged the intent to use flagstone on the side steps. She discussed her preference to use flagstone rather than concrete due to winter safety concerns. She responded to additional questions regarding intentions to extend the brick treatments to the sides of the porch.

Chairperson Drews advised that the subject structure is classified as classic revival, not Craftsman bungalow. He expressed concern over bungalow features being added to the structure, and the opinion that

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 4

“it’s still not working.” He suggested painting the brick to tone it down, and discussed the heavy massing of the front porch treatment. He expressed the opinion that the longer columns and original porch height “tones that down a little.” Ms. Pruitt advised that Ms. Harrington has proposed painting the structure a different color than the existing white.

Commissioner Darney suggested installing the wheelchair lift on the opposite side of the porch from the driveway, and discussion took place with regard to the same. Commissioner Darney advised that he would be abstaining from action on this item. He discussed previous concerns regarding the fluted columns and the vertical design of the brick treatment at the top of the piers. He noted the distinctive horizontal lines of the house and, in reference to conceptual photograph B, reviewed suggested revisions. He expressed opposition to using flagstone for the porch steps because it is a material alien to the area. He referred to original photographs, and noted that the concrete steps correspond with the horizontal lines of the house. In addition, concrete is more in keeping with the rest of the house and the neighborhood. He noted that concrete can be made to be slip resistant. He advised of no problem with the brick, “it’s just a matter of the shape and the horizontal lines.” Chairperson Drews expressed support for keeping the columns the same length and for maintaining the horizontal lines of the house. Commissioner Ossa agreed, and commented that the flagstone and the massive brick piers “really stand out” because of the different surface planes. She provided suggested revisions in reference to the conceptual photographs, and extensive discussion took place with regard to the same. Ms. Pruitt suggested that the applicant submit three or more additional photographic simulations for review by the Commission at the next meeting.

In response to a question, Ms. Harrington discussed plans for the stairs on the side of the porch. Commissioner Smith advised that if the side stairs were previously approved, Ms. Harrington could move forward. Any changes to the previous approval would need to be resubmitted to the Commission. Ms. Harrington advised of the intent to use flagstone on the side stairs. The Commissioners expressed opposition, and discussion took place regarding alternative materials. Ms. Pruitt responded to questions regarding ADA accessibility requirements. Commissioner Ossa expressed concerns with regard to the appearance of the wheelchair lift, and Ms. Harrington advised of plans to screen it with landscape. In response to a question, Commissioners Darney and Ossa described the type of detail needed to review the wheelchair lift. Chairperson Drews explained that the Commission has had a serious problem with conceptual approvals. Commissioner Ossa suggested meeting at the project site prior to the next meeting.

Ms. Pruitt referred to the October 12, 2004 memo from Economic Development/Redevelopment Manager Joe McCarthy, and discussion took place with regard to the same. Ms. Pruitt advised that staff has received many telephone calls regarding Ms. Harrington’s project, most of them supportive. Commissioner Speulda expressed support for the proposed use of the structure, and commended Ms. Harrington on the previously approved dormer addition. Chairperson Drews requested Ms. Harrington to return to the Commission with front façade detail, including the wheelchair lift.

(1-1607) Jed Block provided suggestions with regard to the porch railing and the materials for the porch steps.

Ms. Harrington acknowledged having received sufficient direction from the Commission. Chairperson Drews expressed appreciation for her patience and cooperation. **Commissioner Ossa moved to continue this item to a special meeting. Commissioner Speulda seconded the motion. Motion carried 6-0-1, Commissioner Darney abstaining.** Chairperson Drews thanked Ms. Harrington and Mr. Hannafin. Commissioner Smith left the meeting at 6:50 p.m. A quorum was still present.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 5

F-4. HRC-04-180 ACTION REGARDING A REQUEST FROM PHILIP HERSEY TO ALLOW RESTORATION OF TWO PORCH SECTIONS AND INSTALLATION OF CORBELS/ROOF TRIM ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 700 WEST TELEGRAPH STREET, APN 003-244-02 (1-1653) - Ms. Pruitt thanked Mr. Hersey for his patience, provided background information on this item, and narrated slides of the property. Mr. Hersey responded to questions regarding the original north side porch and plans for the porch steps. He acknowledged that the proposed north porch will be screened in; the south porch will be open from the southern view. He expressed the opinion that, from the east view, both porches should have wainscot. In response to a further question, he described details of the porch rail design. He acknowledged that he would use composition roofing material and that the slope would match the existing porch. He displayed material samples of the wainscot which will be mounted to plywood, proposed corbels to be mounted in front of each post, and trim to be mounted in between the corbels. In response to a question, he advised that the wainscot will be installed on the eastern exposure of both porches, and on the northern porch "all the way around." In response to a further question, he advised that the north porch will be screened. **Commissioner Darney moved to approve item F-4, HRC 04-180, a request from Philip Hersey to allow restoration of northern and southern porches at 700 West Telegraph Street. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo seconded the motion. Motion carried 6-0.** Mr. Hersey requested a copy of the minutes.

F-5. HRC-04-058 AND HRC-04-101 DISCUSSION AND ACTION REGARDING UPDATE AND MINOR ALTERATIONS OF PROJECT BY BRET AND DANI ANDREAS ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 810 NORTH NEVADA STREET, APN 001-192-08 (1-0057) - Ms. Pruitt provided background information on this item and advised of discussions among City staff regarding on-site parking. She further advised that the applicants have proposed the use of a smaller version of a window treatment approved by the Commission in the past, in addition to skylighting. She narrated slides of the subject property.

(1-0089) Don Smit, the general contractor, provided a history of additions and revisions to the structure based on discoveries made as the project has progressed. In response to an outside inquiry regarding the project, he advised of an asbestos survey, required by the City, prior to doing any demolition work. He pointed out areas in which asbestos was discovered, and explained that the project was halted for approximately 20 days to provide the required notification and obtain approval from the City to remove the asbestos materials. He explained the purpose for removing and replacing the walls, and pointed out the location of a previous garage under the extension of the building. He reviewed the request to install three skylights, and advised of their respective dimensions and proposed locations. In response to a previous question, Mr. Smit advised that the dimensions of the originally proposed windows were 3' wide by 5' high. He explained that a 6" portion of the desks in each office would have been visible through the window. The dimensions of the windows were therefore reduced to 2'6" wide by 4' high in order to maintain the same proportions. Mr. Smit pointed out the window trim which was indicated in the original drawings. He described the proposed brown anodized, flat glass, non-operable skylights, and displayed a conceptual photograph of their appearance on the roof. In response to a question, Mr. Smit anticipates having the project completed by the week of November 15th.

Chairperson Drews expressed the opinion that a lack of communication, following the Commission's original approval, generated inquiries over the project. He discussed the need to improve communication. Mr. Smit expressed the opinion that communication is excellent, and advised that he received a telephone call from Ms. Pruitt immediately following concerns expressed by the Commissioners. He explained that this meeting was the first opportunity to return to the Commission to provide a status report on the project.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 6

Discussion took place regarding details of the original approval, including the roof line, the handicap ramp, and façade treatments. In response to a comment, Mr. Smit advised that the floor plan and exterior treatments are exactly the same as was originally proposed. He clarified that the only change was the window dimensions. He advised that installation of the skylights are pending the approval of the Commission. Commissioner Darney commented that the original building was demolished and will be replaced with new materials in the same form. He suggested that the issue is whether to remove and replace an historically significant unsound wall or bolster the wall to make it structurally sound. Chairperson Drews expressed the opinion that the issue would be much larger if the subject property had been determined to be historically significant. Commissioner Darney advised of having no problem with the subject project, but expressed a concern with regard to “where to draw the line” on maintaining historic integrity. Chairperson Drews advised that the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation are fairly clear on the preferred options. Ms. Pruitt advised that the subject property is one of a hand full in the historic district on which no historic survey has ever been conducted.

In response to a question, Mr. Smit advised that the skylight proposed for the Washington Street side of the structure is 2'x4'. He acknowledged that he will enclose the soffits. Commissioner Smith expressed concern with regard to allowing skylights in that they don’t correspond with the historic character of the building, and discussion took place with regard to the same. Mr. Smit responded to questions regarding the windows. **Commissioner Darney moved to approve item HRC-04-101, a request to alter a previously approved plan, with smaller windows and skylights, except that no skylight should be installed on the Washington Street side facing south.** Mr. Smit acknowledged the condition that three skylights will be installed, one 2'x2' and two 2'x4', on the north elevation. **Commissioner Speulda seconded the motion. Motion carried 7-0.**

F-6. DISCUSSION REGARDING CLG GRANTS (1-2194) - Ms. Pruitt circulated copies of the East Side Historic Inventory completed by the consultant, Diana Painter. She advised that Ms. Eskew-Herrmann recently discovered that approximately 70 structures in the historic district have not yet been surveyed. She suggested this may be an appropriate project for Ms. Painter. She reiterated that the Historic District Guidelines are in the process of being updated by Planning and Community Development Department staff. She discussed a 3-D imaging project proposed by Chairperson Drews at a previous meeting, and advised that it had also been considered City-wide at a cost of \$80,000. Commissioner Ossa advised of concerns, on the part of State Historic Preservation Office representatives, regarding a correlation between the project and use of CLG funding for historic resources. Discussion took place with regard to the same and with regard to the function and capabilities of the associated software. In response to a question, Commissioner Ossa advised that the application deadline is December 1st.

F-7. DISCUSSION AND ACTION REGARDING THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED WITHIN THE INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT ON BOARDS, COMMISSIONS, AND COMMITTEES, SPECIFICALLY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION RECOMMENDATIONS (1-2413) - Ms. Pruitt referred to the recommendations included in the agenda materials, and provided background information on the internal audit. She pointed out that this Commission is distinguished from other boards, commissions, and committees (BCCs) in that each seat has an associated specialty of background, education, or experience. She noted that the Internal Auditor did not attend meetings of BCCs which were part of the audit scope, and discussed the service provided by this Commission to applicants. She advised that Planning and Community Development staff disagrees with the recommendation to combine this Commission with the Planning Commission. In response to a question, Mr. Sullivan advised that the Board of Supervisors directed the Internal Auditor to re-examine

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 7

the audit recommendations and return within 30 days. Ms. Pruitt noted that this Commission is mandated by the Nevada Revised Statutes. Commissioner Ossa added that the existence of the Commission fulfills part of the federal requirements of Carson City's CLG status. Discussion took place regarding the differences between the Planning Commission and the Historic Resources Commission membership. Commissioner Darney expressed the opinion that the existing format of Commission meetings is more conducive to addressing the types of projects presented.

In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt reviewed that portion of the audit which addressed staff involvement in the BCCs. Mr. Sullivan expressed regret that the two Supervisors had left the meeting prior to hearing the Commissioners' comments on this item. He advised of having spoken with the Internal Auditor, who indicated that the probability of combining this Commission with the Planning Commission is unlikely. He discussed the Commissioners' expertise and experience associated with their designated positions. He advised that Planning and Community Development staff adamantly opposes combining the two commissions.

Commissioner Ossa reiterated that Carson City's CLG status requires a preservation board comprised of a certain number of members with specific expertise. She advised that combining this Commission with the Planning Commission is an option to consider, but indicated that it could conflict with CLG requirements and funding at some point in the future. With regard to membership criteria, she advised of the opportunity to negotiate with the State Historic Preservation Office if filling a position becomes a problem. Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo suggested that combining the commissions would most likely result in the agenda and discussions becoming naturally segregated. Commissioner Ossa expressed the opinion that the current way of doing things has worked well for over 20 years, and the Commissioners agreed.

Mr. Sullivan advised that each member of the Board of Supervisors has acknowledged the service provided by the Commissioners. He expressed the opinion that the Commission should continue with the Historic Preservation Awards program. Commissioner Darney commented that the purpose of the Commission is not just to require property owners to conform to a standard; it is to improve the community by encouraging historic property owners to continuously add to the quality of their historic property. Mr. Sullivan expressed the opinion that if the Internal Auditor had attended a meeting of this Commission, he would have seen the difference in the way the Commissioners interact with applicants. Commissioner Darney commented that the audit report only reaffirms the existence and operation of the Commission. Discussion took place regarding the differences in format between the Sierra Room and the Capitol Conference Room. Mr. Sullivan advised that the Commissioners' comments would be forwarded to the Board of Supervisors.

G. FUTURE COMMISSION ITEMS (1-2981) - Ms. Pruitt discussed the possibility of changing the location of the Commission meetings to the Community Center Sierra Room. She will agendize discussion of this matter for the next meeting.

H. INTERNAL COMMUNICATIONS AND ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

H-1. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM STAFF (1-3182) - None.

H-2. COMMENTS AND STATUS REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS (1-3186) - Vice Chairperson Lopiccolo advised that the Olcovich House variance was approved, and that the garage can be completed.

CARSON CITY HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION

Minutes of the October 12, 2004 Meeting

Page 8

In response to a question, Ms. Pruitt advised that she is working with Office Support Technician Juanita Smith to get the Historic Preservation Awards mounted. She suggested scheduling a joint meeting with the Board of Supervisors in January 2005 and presenting the Historic Preservation Awards at that time. In response to a further question, Ms. Pruitt advised that \$1,000 is available in the Commission's training budget. Mr. Sullivan advised that the American Planning Association National Conference is scheduled for March 2005 in San Francisco. He advised that seminars in historic preservation are occasionally scheduled; the conference schedule is usually published by the end of December. Discussion took place regarding the proximity of the conference to Carson City and the opportunity to attend. Mr. Sullivan advised of the Planning Commission's request to schedule a joint meeting with this Commission to discuss items of mutual interest. Chairperson Drews requested Ms. Pruitt to invite City Manager Linda Ritter to the next regular Commission meeting.

I. ACTION ON ADJOURNMENT (1-3380) - Commissioner Baker moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:00 p.m. Commissioner Ossa seconded the motion. Motion carried 6-0.

The Minutes of the October 12, 2004 meeting of the Historic Resources Commission are so approved this 9th day of November, 2004.

MICHAEL DREWS, Chair